



**International Convention on
the Elimination of All Forms
of Racial Discrimination**

Distr.: General
25 April 2023

Original: English

Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
109th session

Summary record of the 2968th meeting

Held at the Palais Wilson, Geneva, on Wednesday, 19 April 2023, at 10 a.m.

Chair: Ms. Shepherd

Contents

Consideration of reports, comments and information submitted by States parties under article 9 of the Convention (*continued*)

Combined eighteenth and nineteenth periodic reports of Portugal (continued)

This record is subject to correction. Corrections should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent within one week of the date of the present record to the Documents Management Section (DMS-DCM@un.org).

Any corrected records of the public meetings of the Committee at this session will be reissued for technical reasons after the end of the session.



The meeting was called to order at 10 a.m.

Consideration of reports, comments and information submitted by States parties under article 9 of the Convention *(continued)*

Combined eighteenth and nineteenth periodic reports of Portugal (CERD/C/PRT/18-19; CERD/C/PRT/Q/18-19) (continued)

1. *At the invitation of the Chair, the delegation of Portugal joined the meeting.*
2. **Ms. Chung** (Country Rapporteur) said that the Committee would appreciate receiving additional information on the measures taken by the Consultative Group for the Integration of Roma Communities and their impact on implementation of the National Roma Communities Integration Strategy, for instance in terms of the allocation of budgetary and human resources. It would also welcome information on measures taken to combat structural discrimination against Roma and statistics on the access of Roma to adequate housing and education. The Committee would like to hear about the status of implementation of the municipal and intercultural mediators' projects on behalf of migrants and Roma communities and the results achieved to date. It would be useful to know how intercultural training for police officers was provided under the Together for All Programme and whether it included anti-oppression and anti-racism training, as well as advice on combating racial stereotypes. She would appreciate an explanation of the very high rates of discrimination reported by Roma respondents in surveys conducted by the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) and information on concrete measures taken to ensure access to employment, to prohibit discrimination and harassment in the workplace due to a person's race or ethnic origin, and to ensure equal access for Roma to public and private services.
3. She asked what measures had been taken to address ideas of racial hierarchy and to combat systemic and institutional racism against people of African descent, for example by initiating a national dialogue on the colonial past aimed at acknowledging past wrongdoings. She also wished to know whether steps had been taken to involve people of African descent in the elaboration and implementation of measures to address their needs and concerns. According to the Commission for Equality and Against Racial Discrimination, the largest group of people identified as victims in 655 complaints of discrimination received in 2020 were Brazilians or persons of Brazilian origin. The Committee would appreciate information on that population group and the discrimination to which they were subjected. The Working Group of Experts on People of African Descent had stated that the Portuguese language was a source of racial profiling, since European-inflected Portuguese created access and African- and Brazilian-inflected Portuguese created barriers to education and employment. She would be interested in hearing about any action taken to address the issue.
4. The Committee was concerned about reports of forced evictions of people of African descent and Roma during the coronavirus disease (COVID-19) pandemic. It would welcome information regarding any measures taken to address housing segregation, to implement the 2019 Basic Housing Act, to protect minorities, in particular people of African descent, Roma and migrants, from forced evictions or to provide them with remedial solutions, and to promote their access to health care.
5. She would be grateful for information on measures taken to address racial discrimination in the education system and to ensure access to education for children belonging to ethnic minorities, in particular children of migrant origin, children of African descent and Roma children. She also wished to know what measures were taken to correct school curricula and textbooks that minimized the violence of colonialism and justified racial hierarchy.
6. The Committee would appreciate information on action taken to address the low employment rate among Roma communities and communities of African descent, as well as relevant statistics.
7. In addition, the Committee would appreciate information on measures taken to combat multiple forms of discrimination against Roma women, women of African descent, migrant women and women asylum-seekers and refugees, and on measures to address intersectional discrimination against older persons and persons with disabilities from ethnic

minority groups and non-citizens. She wished to hear about any special measures or initiatives aimed at addressing multiple and intersectional discrimination against lesbian, gay, bisexual, transexual and intersex persons. She would welcome information on the findings of the Studies on Women launched in June 2019 aimed at increasing knowledge about intersecting inequalities of migrant women, including women of African descent. She would appreciate an update regarding the implementation of the projects of the Roma Associations Support Programme listed in the State party's report.

8. In 2019, the High Commission for Migration, in collaboration with the European Network for Migrant Women, had organized an international seminar on "Intersectionality: the situation of black women and women of African descent". The Committee would like to know what measures had been implemented as a result of the seminar. The Government had launched the first Common Annual Training Plan on Violence against Women and Domestic Violence in June 2020. She was interested in hearing about its implementation and its impact on victims of domestic violence, especially Roma women and women of other ethnicities.

9. The Committee would like to know what measures had been taken to raise awareness of the existence of equality bodies such as the Commission for Citizenship and Gender Equality and the Commission for Equality in Labour and Employment, particularly among ethnic minorities and non-citizens. She wished to know whether the State party had consulted civil society organizations on the preparation of the report and whether they participated in the development of programmes and strategies aimed at addressing systemic racism and in the implementation of the Strategic Plan for Migration. The Committee wondered why it had not received any alternative reports from civil society organizations.

10. **Mr. Guissé** (Country Task Force) said that the Committee wished to be informed of the impact of measures to promote the social integration of migrants, asylum-seekers, refugees and stateless persons, including their access to employment, education and an adequate standard of living.

11. He commended the State party on being one of the first countries in the world to establish a national plan for the implementation of the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration. The Committee would appreciate information on the measures taken to continue working towards the objectives of the Strategic Plan for Migration since 2020. It would also welcome statistics on the nationality, access to housing and legal status of migrants, and especially on the situation of irregular migrant workers. He wished to know whether the State party had considered ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families. He asked what was the procedure for determining statelessness and whether the State party had considered ratifying the Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons.

12. Recalling its recommendation, as contained in its previous concluding observations ([CERD/C/PRT/CO/15-17](#)), that the State party should take effective measures to prevent the excessive use of force by law enforcement officials, and its general recommendation No. 36 on preventing and combating racial profiling by law enforcement officials, the Committee noted that eight police officers had been found guilty in 2019 of kidnapping and beating up six black youths. The Committee would appreciate information about the disciplinary investigations conducted, the penalties imposed on all law enforcement officials involved in the event, and the measures taken to ensure that law enforcement officials refrained from using excessive force and respected human rights. It also wished to hear about any remedies or reparations provided to victims.

13. The Committee wondered whether legislative or administrative measures had been taken to prohibit and sanction racial profiling by law enforcement officials and to prevent discrimination in the administration of justice. It would also be grateful for information on measures taken by the State party to prevent the excessive use of force, ill-treatment and abuse of authority against persons belonging to ethnic minorities, in particular persons of African descent and Roma, and on concrete measures, such as prompt, effective and impartial investigations, undertaken on their behalf.

14. The Committee would appreciate updated information on the new legal framework governing access to justice and its impact in terms of facilitating access to justice for victims of racial discrimination, and preventing the excessive use of force by law enforcement

officials or racial profiling. It would also like to hear about training courses for law enforcement officials on how to receive, file and address complaints of racial discrimination. The Committee had taken note of the racially motivated murder of a black actor, Bruno Candé, by a white man on 25 July 2020. The Committee wished to know how the police and the judiciary had addressed the crime and what measures the Government had taken to prevent such crimes.

15. Recalling the question raised by Ms. Tebie at the previous meeting concerning the use of frogs to insult a specific group, he would appreciate receiving detailed information on measures taken to combat attitudes based on prejudice and stereotypes that were conducive to racial discrimination against protected minorities, in particular Roma communities, people of African descent, migrants, asylum-seekers and refugees. The Committee also wished to hear about measures taken to raise awareness among the public, civil servants and law enforcement officials of the importance of cultural diversity, tolerance and inter-ethnic understanding, as well as measures taken to include the history of colonialism, slavery and their consequences in school textbooks and teaching materials. Lastly, the Committee would appreciate information about measures taken or envisaged to promote awareness of the cultural heritage and history of minority groups and their contribution to Portuguese society and culture.

16. **Mr. Diaby** said that the State party had failed to acknowledge its participation in the major historical crimes of slave trading and genocide of black people, which were not subject to a statute of limitations. He wished to know whether the State party would acknowledge the crimes, apologize publicly to people who continued to suffer from its impact, enact relevant legislation and promote restorative justice.

17. **The Chair** said that the Caribbean Community (CARICOM) had raised the issue some years previously and that the State party had failed to respond.

18. **Mr. Amir**, noting that the European Union allocated funds to support action on behalf of Roma communities in its member States, asked whether the State party received such funds. He wished to know whether complaints could be filed when racist acts were perpetrated against Roma and, if so, what were the requisite procedures.

19. He also wished to know why the State party failed to acknowledge its historic involvement in the slave trade and why no effort had been made to change how society viewed slavery. Would the Government establish a commission to address the matter, in partnership with African countries?

20. **Ms. Stavrinaki** said that she would welcome specific information on the perpetrators and victims of hate crimes and on the State party's efforts to monitor those crimes.

The meeting was suspended at 10.45 a.m. and resumed at 11.05 a.m.

21. **A representative of Portugal** said that under the Constitution, ratified international instruments became part of domestic law; domestic legislation was then adapted to meet international obligations. Basic training for judges covered human rights and the Convention, and judges were required by law to undertake continuing education, which was delivered by the Centre for Judicial Studies. To date, more than 500 judges had participated in seven courses on racial discrimination and hate speech, which had addressed topics such as social media and protection of migrants. By 2021, the Ministry of Justice had delivered 341 hours of training on hate speech and racial discrimination to more than 1,200 public officials from across the judiciary.

22. The police had recorded 82 complaints of incitement to hatred in 2019, 132 in 2020 and 150 in 2021. That increase reflected a growing awareness of rights and the prohibition of such behaviour. In 2020, 135 complaints had been referred to the Public Prosecution Service, rising to 252 in 2022. To assist in the disaggregation of data, the police logged crimes motivated by discrimination using the keyword "hate crime"; in that context, nationality, rather than ethnic origin, was recorded. The same was true for statistics on prisoners, which revealed that 15 per cent of inmates were foreigners. A study of the prison population was planned as part of the National Plan to Combat Racism and Discrimination, with the aim of identifying the needs and expectations of different ethnic groups.

23. **A representative of Portugal** said that the National Strategy for the Integration of Roma Communities had been extended in 2018 and its aims and objectives adjusted. The new strategy comprised eight strategic objectives and was based on the principles of interculturality, non-discrimination, cooperation and participation, community-based action and gender equality. Seventy per cent of the planned measures had been implemented in the first year, rising to more than 74 per cent by 2021. The new Advisory Group for Roma Communities, whose 36 permanent members met on a quarterly basis, coordinated the revised strategy and supported the High Commission for Migration in monitoring its implementation. According to the most recent report on the strategy's implementation, from 2021, 45 per cent of the measures implemented related to three strategic objectives: promoting inclusive citizenship and non-discrimination, equal access to education, and full and equitable participation in the labour market. The measures implemented included training on Roma cultural practices for professionals in law enforcement, education, health care and child protection. The Observatory for Roma Communities conducted studies, disseminated information and participated in international seminars with the aim of eradicating stereotypes. In order to promote education among Roma communities, two programmes developed in partnership with Roma associations provided grants to students in upper secondary school and higher education; the latter had provided around 40 grants in the 2020–2021 academic year.

24. Local action plans on the integration of Roma communities had been developed, and teams of intercultural mediators, funded by the European Social Fund, worked in most municipalities to foster relations between community leaders, increase the participation by members of Roma and migrant communities and resolve conflicts. That project had led to improvements in Roma children's school attainment and attendance and heightened awareness among local service providers and public officials. Frogs were traditionally linked to witchcraft in Roma communities in Portugal, and an exhibition of photographs and ceramic frogs toured the country to raise awareness of that fact.

25. **A representative of Portugal** said that three publications had been produced on the history of persons of African descent in Portugal. A day of commemoration of that group had been organized, along with several other similar events, and its history had been communicated through work by civil society and local authorities with young persons. More than 100 projects on persons of African descent had been delivered through youth leaders around the country under the Choices programme, and attention would be drawn to the importance of the International Decade for People of African Descent as the Choices programme came to a close. A poster and brochure would be produced to inform communities of how they could build on the work undertaken during the Decade. A protocol for cooperation had been signed with the School Libraries Network to train teachers on matters related to persons of African descent. The High Commission for Migration had provided financial support to 26 initiatives implemented by organizations representing migrants and refugees, including several that focused on persons of African descent. Local associations had also undertaken several initiatives to support students of African origin from particularly disadvantaged backgrounds during the COVID-19 pandemic.

26. With regard to intersectionality, migrant and refugee women had benefited from online seminars that enabled women entrepreneurs to exchange good practices, and women had made up more than 70 per cent of participants in a business development course for migrants and refugees. More than 180 businesses had been set up by women as a result of the course. The Government worked with civil society to support migrant victims of domestic violence, and in November 2020 victim support offices had been established within the national support centres for migrant integration, to provide assistance, information and referrals to migrant victims of domestic violence and harmful traditional practices. That work was carried out in conjunction with the National Support Network for Victims of Domestic Violence and other bodies when necessary, including law enforcement. By February 2023, the victim support offices had assisted 365 persons, 80 per cent of whom had been women. All refugees and migrants were welcome at the national support centres, regardless of sexual identity. A project was under development that aimed to improve inclusivity at support centres by drawing on the experience and good practices of the local authorities of Amsterdam.

27. **A representative of Portugal** said that, even before the signing of the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration, his Government had implemented a strategic migration plan that assisted persons with irregular migration status. A new plan adopted in 2019 reflected the 23 objectives of the Global Compact, and Portugal had been the first European country to become a champion country for the Compact. The national support centres for migrant integration brought together a range of institutions, including the Ministry of Health, and services such as legal assistance. They were free of charge and open to all migrants, regardless of status. The four national offices worked closely with each other and had assisted 502,000 persons. Similar services were also provided at 156 local support centres throughout the country that worked with municipal authorities, the High Commission for Migration and civil society; they had assisted more than 450,000 persons.

28. **A representative of Portugal** said that an inclusive education law and a law defining the curriculum of basic and secondary education had been adopted in 2018. Schools were required to have a citizenship education strategy, which ensured that all pupils left school having learned about human rights and interculturality.

29. In 2022, a specific profile had been created for Roma pupils, and a targeted programme had achieved a school attendance rate of 87.2 per cent and a completion rate of 74 per cent in that group. A programme set up with European bodies and the High Commission for Migration had improved the support to and integration of Roma children in schools. A national film programme highlighting human rights topics had been attended by 150,000 pupils, including 10,000 Roma, and 9,000 teachers. Lessons in Portuguese as a foreign language helped promote integration and non-discrimination but were not offered to pupils whose mother tongue was Portuguese. The diversity and richness of the Portuguese language was welcomed.

30. The school curriculum was one tool used to combat discrimination, recognize and enhance diversity, and defend freedom and equality. It included works by authors not only from Portugal but from the wider Portuguese-speaking world and, since 2017, pupils from the age of 10 years had learned about colonialism, slavery, historical memory and the importance of interculturality. Legislation governed the content of educational texts, and the Ministry of Education contacted the publisher or author concerned if any changes were deemed necessary. Another tool for combating racial discrimination in schools was a manual produced with the involvement of the Directorate-General for Education as well as migrant communities, teachers, parents and pupils who had experienced racial discrimination. It would be presented to schools throughout the country in 2023 as part of an awareness-raising campaign.

31. **A representative of Portugal** said that, over the previous two years, more than 2,000 teachers had been involved in 50 specific training initiatives aimed at combating discrimination and promoting citizenship. There was a national plan to promote culture in schools, and sport was also used to help promote citizenship and diversity among pupils.

32. Measures introduced in recent years to make curricula more flexible, promote different routes into higher education and foster diversity had helped more students enter university via vocational pathways. According to a recent survey, higher education institutions were promoting more than 350 initiatives on questions pertaining to human rights, citizenship and combating discrimination. The Foundation for Science and Technology had invested €1.2 million over the previous two years in research into human rights topics, including hate speech and incitement to hatred.

33. **A representative of Portugal** said that the State advocated the principle of equality in access to public housing. However, a certain amount of positive discrimination was exercised in order to support more vulnerable groups. The *Primeiro Direito* (First Right) programme exemplified that, providing support to persons living in precarious housing conditions, including members of the Roma community. The Government was aware of the need to increase the housing stock, improve inclusion and address issues related to rent and segregation.

34. Existing financial support programmes for families threatened with eviction from their homes were to be bolstered by packages under discussion in parliament. Forced eviction was a last resort that must be approved by a judge and involved the social services, with

alternative housing solutions being found for those affected. During the COVID-19 pandemic, forced evictions had been put on hold and support had been provided to help tenants with rent payments. Measures had also been taken to suspend social housing rent payments, in order to reduce the economic burden on tenants.

35. **A representative of Portugal** said that the Plan for the Prevention of Acts of Discrimination in the Security Forces and Services, currently in its second year of implementation, was producing tangible results. It helped combat racial profiling by the National Republican Guard and the Public Security Police by rejecting potential recruits who displayed attitudes or personality traits that ran counter to the values of the rule of law and human rights. Successful recruits received continuing training throughout their careers designed to combat discrimination and foster respect for human rights. A total of 75 hours of courses covered contemporary subjects affecting the police such as diversity, gender, racism, mental health and LGBTQI+ issues. The Inspectorate-General of Home Affairs also provided the police with awareness-raising training in human rights subjects, and a human rights officer played a key role in ensuring that law enforcement officials upheld human rights.

36. Law enforcement officials played an important part in the fight against prejudice and stereotypes. In the 2021/22 academic year, the police had undertaken more than 800 human rights awareness-raising initiatives attended by close to 70,000 school pupils as part of the Safe Schools Programme. The topics covered included bullying, cyberbullying, gender equality, intercultural dialogue, citizenship, discrimination, migration, trafficking in persons, domestic violence and dating violence.

37. Both the Public Security Police and the National Republican Guard had internal rules on the use of force that were in line with basic human rights requirements and went beyond legislative provisions. They also received training on the subject. Law enforcement officials had played a leading role in the adoption of a law regulating the use of body cameras.

38. **A representative of Portugal** said that, following the 2018 case involving five members of the National Republican Guard, one officer had been dismissed and sentenced to 6 years in prison and another had been suspended from duty for 200 days and handed a 5-year suspended prison sentence. The other three had been suspended for 90 days and received shorter suspended sentences.

39. On 23 March 2023, the Inspectorate-General of Home Affairs had signed a protocol with the Inspectorate-General of Justice Services and the Directorate-General for Reintegration and Prison Services with a view to speeding up communication procedures, giving substance to a recommendation of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Persons taken into custody with injuries that they claimed had been caused by police actions could make a statement that would reach the Inspectorate-General of Home Affairs within 48 hours.

40. **A representative of Portugal** said that, in 2021, the High Commission for Migration and the Commission for Equality and Against Racial Discrimination had strengthened protocols signed with the Public Security Police and the National Republican Guard. They covered more than 3,000 law enforcement officers, who were given awareness-raising training about Roma communities, migrants and racial discrimination. The training aimed to break down prejudice and stereotypes, improve knowledge of the legal framework combating racial discrimination under Act 93/2017, and equip law enforcement officials with tools to help victims of racial discrimination and support them in collecting the evidence needed to bring legal proceedings.

41. Free online courses for civil servants and the general public explained the background of racial discrimination and helped increase knowledge of interculturality, thereby breaking down prejudice and stereotypes.

42. In 2017, Brazilian nationality had been mentioned as a discriminating factor in 10 per cent of complaints addressed to the Commission for Equality and Against Racial Discrimination. In 2022, that proportion had risen to 34 per cent. Possible explanations of the increase included the fact that the 300,000 Brazilian nationals with residence permits formed the largest migrant community in the country or that Brazilian nationals were more aware of discrimination than other population groups.

43. **A representative of Portugal** said that access to justice, employment and social benefits was universal and guaranteed to everyone residing in the country. The State provided support for access to justice on a means-tested basis. Individuals could check their eligibility for legal aid using a simulator on the Social Security Institute website and apply for it at Social Security offices, by email or via an online platform. Both legal counsel and legal representation were available, and 188,000 consultations had been made in 2022.

44. Public policy on employment did not specifically target migrants or the Roma community, but those groups could benefit from apprenticeship and placement programmes designed to help vulnerable groups. The Employment and Vocational Training Institute provided Portuguese language training to foreign citizens in order to help them integrate and find employment.

45. The Social Security Institute had worked with the High Commission for Migration to establish a network of offices that helped migrants to find employment. In 2022, there had been 23 such offices around the country. In 2021 and 2022, the offices had provided support to over 13,000 people and had made over 3,000 job offers. The Employment and Vocational Training Institute played a leading role in implementing the National Strategy for the Integration of Roma Communities. It promoted access to employment for Roma women, encouraged Roma to register with job centres and trained public officials in the area of cultural diversity. In 2022, over 1,800 Roma had registered with job centres, around 1,650 had been issued with personal employment plans and over 1,800 had participated in activities aimed at promoting their access to employment.

46. People of African descent were treated equally and enjoyed the same rights, irrespective of whether they were Portuguese nationals or nationals of other countries who held residence permits. In 2022, over 7,600 people born in Africa had been registered as unemployed, over 10,800 had been looking for work and over 2,200 had received support. The Social Security Institute worked with labour inspectors with a view to identifying instances of discrimination.

47. **A representative of Portugal** said that Portugal had ratified the Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons in 2012. No member State of the European Union had ratified the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families because responsibility for some of the areas addressed by that Convention had been delegated to the European institutions. For that reason, member States would not be able to ratify it until they had established a concerted position on its ratification. However, a number of the provisions of that Convention had been incorporated into national law, and Portugal had ratified the International Labour Organization (ILO) Migration for Employment Convention (Revised), 1949 (No. 97) and the ILO Migrant Workers (Supplementary Provisions) Convention, 1975 (No. 143).

48. The National Committee for Human Rights maintained a list of around 200 civil society organizations, including a large number whose work involved combating racism. The organizations on the list had been briefed about the constructive dialogue and the various channels by which information could be submitted to the Committee. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs shared information with civil society organizations, including on issues surrounding racism, and tried to promote dialogue between such organizations and the Treaty bodies. It had briefed civil society organizations about the first Permanent Forum of People of African Descent and would disseminate the Committee's concluding observations. The Ministry met with civil society organizations on an annual basis and, in 2021, had used the occasion of the meeting to discuss the National Plan to Combat Racism and Discrimination.

49. **Ms. Almeida Rodrigues** (Portugal) said that Portugal was a community of people of diverse origins who had come together to form a single political entity. The principles of equality and non-discrimination were established in the Constitution, which had drawn inspiration from humanism. Portuguese citizens did not recognize Mr. Diaby's description of Portugal as a country that refused to acknowledge its past.

50. The tragic murder of the actor Bruno Candé had been tried as a racially motivated crime. The murderer had been handed a sentence of 29 years and 9 months' imprisonment and had been ordered to pay compensation in the amount of €160,000 to the actor's children. The sentence had been highly symbolic as the maximum sentence available under Portuguese

law was 25 years' imprisonment. The national identity was reflected in the solidarity expressed by the entire country towards the victim's family. Fortunately, crimes of that nature were rare in Portugal.

51. **Mr. Amir** said that he wished to know whether the discrimination directed at Brazilian nationals was based on their nationality or on the colour of their skin.

52. **A representative of Portugal**, referring to the data on complaints of discrimination mentioned earlier in the discussion, said that the persons who had reported being victims of discrimination had stated that the discrimination had been based on their nationality. If it had been based on their skin colour, that would have been reflected in the data.

53. **Mr. Diaby** said that he welcomed the fact that information on the colonial past of Portugal had been included in school textbooks since 2007 but was concerned to note that teachers were not required to use those textbooks in their lessons. He wondered whether the Government would consider adopting a law providing for official recognition of the historical role played by Portugal in colonialism and the slave trade.

54. **Ms. Esseneme** said that she would welcome confirmation of the fact that students were not required to use or consult textbooks addressing the role played by Portugal in colonialism and the slave trade. She wondered whether the international human rights instruments ratified by Portugal were applied automatically by judges or whether it was necessary for parties to legal proceedings or their lawyers to invoke them.

55. **A representative of Portugal** said that, in considering what subjects were taught in schools, it was necessary to distinguish between the curriculum and school textbooks. It was mandatory for teachers to cover the subjects listed in the curriculum, which included the participation of Portugal in colonialism and the slave trade, but it was not mandatory for teachers to use any particular textbooks. The vast majority of teachers did use textbooks but they were not required to do so.

56. **A representative of Portugal** said that lawmakers were required to bring national law into line with the international treaties ratified by Portugal. It was not necessary for judges to invoke those treaties directly as their provisions were incorporated into national law. However, judges were free to invoke them to explain the basis of a national law or if they felt that national law did not have sufficient scope for the requirements of a particular case. Judges received ongoing training on the international instruments ratified by Portugal.

57. **Ms. Almeida Rodrigues** (Portugal) said that the Government had adopted a legally binding plan that required the State to face up to its past, including the role played by Portugal in colonialism.

58. **Ms. Chung** said that she wondered whether it was possible that attitudes towards Brazilian citizens in Portugal were informed by Portuguese citizens' knowledge that Brazil had formerly been a colony of Portugal. The Government might take steps to protect Brazilian citizens and ensure that their lives in Portugal were free from discrimination.

59. **Mr. Guissé**, noting that a direct link existed between racial profiling and police violence, said that he wished to know what the State party was doing to prevent racial profiling.

60. **Mr. Diaby** said it was still not clear whether Portugal had ratified the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness or the 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons. He wondered whether the State party had adopted a national plan on the eradication of statelessness.

61. **A representative of Portugal** said that Portugal had ratified both Conventions in 2012.

62. **Ms. Chung** said that she wished to thank the delegation for the honest and constructive dialogue. For its next periodic review, the State party might consider ensuring that an alternative report was submitted to the Committee by non-governmental organizations and that representatives of such organizations attended the constructive dialogue.

63. **Ms. Almeida Rodrigues** (Portugal) said that the delegation had tried to paint an accurate picture of the situation in Portugal. The Government acknowledged that the State

was primarily responsible for combating racism and xenophobia, and that there was a gap between the goals that it had set in that regard and the results obtained. In order to combat the scourge of racism, it would be necessary to obtain better data, which would be provided by the survey on living conditions, origins and trajectories of the resident population. Equally important would be the work conducted by the new Observatory operating within the Faculty of Law of the Nova University Lisbon. Once quality data had been obtained, they would be used to implement the various plans and policies established to combat racism and discrimination and ensure respect for human rights in all areas of life.

64. Within a few days, Portugal would be commemorating the forty-ninth anniversary of the Carnation Revolution, which had brought freedom and democracy to Portugal. Abolishing the dictatorship had meant throwing off the yoke of colonialism, which was why the revolution could be seen as a movement against racism. The world had recently witnessed a resurgence of populist, xenophobic and racist political movements and rising levels of hate crime. In response, it would be necessary to provide better education and training, to hand down more effective punishments to perpetrators, to break down stereotypes, to adopt an intersectional approach and to ensure respect for economic, social and cultural rights. The Government would continue to combat racism and build a fairer and more equal Portugal, in line with the ideals of the Carnation Revolution.

The meeting rose at 12.55 p.m.